

Request for Reconsideration Panel Information

Panel Members

Liz von Nagy
Beth Shelley
Caitlin Classen
Carrie Ishaq
John Synnott
Susie Snow
Carol Scrimgeour
Patricia DuBray

Thank you for serving on this panel. Please read the work, and the included supporting information, in its entirety and as you read, think about these questions.

1. What do you feel the message(s) of this book is/are?
2. What value do you feel this work brings to the EWSD?

Summary of Reconsideration Process:

1. A formal request for reconsideration is submitted to the school principal and librarian.
2. A panel is formed to read, review, and discuss the work in question.
 - a. In addition to reading the work, the panel will also read and consider professional reviews, the media selection procedure of the district, awards won by the work, and Vermont State Law (if applicable).
3. The panel reaches a conclusion by majority vote regarding whether the book will remain in the school library or not.

Discussion Panel Norms:

- **Refrain from emotional responses:** Focus on the facts.
- **Respect time:** start/end on time; use time well during meeting; be sensitive to the time constraints of others
- **Objectives:** Construct clear agendas, stick to the agenda at each meeting
- **Allow others sufficient “air time” and “think time”:** monitor how frequently and how long you speak; allow others to enter the conversation; pay attention to those who haven’t spoken, allow processing time before decisions are made, put future items into a “parking lot”
- **Use “I” statements:** express your own opinions and experiences
- **Listen well:** no side conversations; ask clarifying questions
- **Assume good intentions:** recognize different perspectives and perceptions
- **Freely attend to personal needs:** stand up, stretch, use the bathroom, etc., step out if needed

Work Under Review: *Gender Queer* by Maia Kobabe

Summary (from the publisher): In 2014, Maia Kobabe, who uses e/em/eir pronouns, thought that a comic of reading statistics would be the last autobiographical comic e would ever write. At the time, it was the only thing e felt comfortable with strangers knowing about em. Now, *Gender Queer* is here. Maia's intensely cathartic autobiography charts eir journey of self-identity, which includes the mortification and confusion of adolescent crushes, grappling with how to come out to family and society, bonding with friends over erotic gay fanfiction, and facing the trauma and fundamental violation of pap smears. Started as a way to explain to eir family what it means to be nonbinary and asexual, *Gender Queer* is more than a personal story: it is a useful and touching guide on

Request for Reconsideration Panel Information

genderidentity—what it means and how to think about it—for advocates, friends, and humans everywhere.

Selection Criteria Met:

- “Support and enrich the curriculum and/or students’ personal interests and learning”
- “Meet high standards in literary, artistic, and aesthetic quality; technical aspects; and physical format”
- “Be appropriate for the subject area and for the age, emotional development, ability level, learning styles, and social, emotional, and intellectual development of the students for whom the materials are selected”
- “Earn favorable reviews in standard reviewing sources and/or favorable recommendations based on preview and examination of materials by professional personnel”
- “Represent differing viewpoints on controversial issues, while rejecting hate speech and words and ideas that further harm historically marginalized communities”
- “Provide a global perspective and promote diversity and inclusion by increasing/expanding materials written and created by BIPOC and LGBT authors and illustrators”

Relevant Vermont State Laws

A work needs to include all of the below characteristics (A-C) to be considered “Harmful to minors” according to the state of Vermont(13 V.S.A. § 2802):

(6) "Harmful to minors" means that quality of any description or representation, in whatever form, of nudity, sexual conduct, sexual excitement, or sado-masochistic abuse, when it:

(A) Predominantly appeals to the prurient, shameful, or morbid interest of minors; and

(B) Is patently offensive to prevailing standards in the adult community in the State of Vermont as a whole with respect to what is suitable material for minors; and

(C) Is taken as a whole, lacks serious literary, artistic, political, or scientific value, for minors.

<https://legislature.vermont.gov/statutes/section/13/063/02802>

<https://legislature.vermont.gov/statutes/section/13/063/02801>

Reviews

Awards:

[Alex Award. \(2020. ALA\)](#)

The Alex Awards are given to ten books written for adults that have special appeal to young adults, ages 12 through 18.¹

[Stonewall Book Award \(2020. ALA\)](#)

The first and most enduring award for LGBTQIA+ books is the Stonewall Book Awards, sponsored by the American Library Association's Rainbow Round Table.²

[Ignatz Award Nominee \(2016, 2019\)](#)

¹ American Library Association: Alex Award (<https://www.ala.org/yalsa/alex-awards>)

² American Library Association: Stonewall Award (<https://www.ala.org/rt/rrt/award/stonewall/honored>)

Request for Reconsideration Panel Information

The Ignatz recognizes exceptional work that challenges popular notions of what comics can achieve, both as an art form and as a means of personal expression.³

Timeline for Panel Evaluation:

Week of 12/15: Assemble Panel

Next Step: Panel members read and evaluate work

Next Step: Panel members meet to discuss the work and make a decision

[ALA's Formal Reconsideration Recommendations](#)

³ Small Press Expo: Ignatz Award (<https://www.smallpresseexpo.com/ignatz-awards>)